



## **Appendix F**

Section 1c:  
UCD Ballsbridge  
to City Centre Section  
– Merrion Road  
Route Options  
Assessment  
MCA Table

**Table F.1: Merrion Road MCA**

<b>Appraisal Criteria</b>	<b>Sub-Criteria</b>	<b>Option MR1</b> (EPR Option)	<b>Option MR2</b> (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)	<b>Option MR3</b> (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	<b>Option MR4</b> (3-lanes with One-Way E-bound)
<b>1 Economy</b>	<b>1A Capital Cost</b>	<p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Major roadway widening and site clearance along the length of the section</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> <li>- Upgrade of pedestrian crossing at Wanderers</li> <li>- Signalisation of Shrewsbury Road Junction</li> <li>- Upgrade of Ailesbury Road junction</li> <li>- Upgrade of pedestrian crossing at Merrion Centre</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>587 sqm Private Land</p> <p>31 Properties affected</p>	<p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway widening and site clearance</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> <li>- Upgrade of pedestrian crossing at Wanderers</li> <li>- Signalisation of Shrewsbury Road Junction</li> <li>- Upgrade of Ailesbury Road junction</li> <li>- Upgrade of pedestrian crossing at Merrion Centre</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>146 sqm Private Land</p> <p>4 Properties affected</p>	<p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway realignment largely within the existing kerb lines,</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> <li>- Upgrade of pedestrian crossing at Wanderers</li> <li>- Signalisation of Shrewsbury Road Junction</li> <li>- Upgrade of Ailesbury Road junction</li> <li>- Upgrade of pedestrian crossing at Merrion Centre</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>0 sqm Private Land</p> <p>0 Properties affected</p>	<p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway widening and site clearance</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> <li>- Upgrade of pedestrian crossing at Wanderers</li> <li>- Signalisation of Shrewsbury Road Junction</li> <li>- Upgrade of Ailesbury Road junction</li> <li>- Upgrade of pedestrian crossing at Merrion Centre</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>0 sqm Private Land</p> <p>0 Properties affected</p>
	<b>Rank</b>				

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option MR1 (EPR Option)	Option MR2 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)	Option MR3 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option MR4 (3-lanes with One-Way E-bound)
	<b>1B Transport Quality &amp; Reliability</b>	Journey Time Inbound: 4.0 mins Journey Time Outbound: 3.7 mins Length: 1.14 km No. of Junctions: 2 No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 2  Full physical bus priority in both directions.	Journey Time Inbound: 4.5 mins Journey Time Outbound: 4.2 mins Length: 1.14 km No. of Junctions: 2 No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 2  Full physical bus priority provided in bus lanes. Bus priority provided by the signal-controlled bus priority where bus lanes are not provided.	Journey Time Inbound: 4.3 mins Journey Time Outbound: 4.0 mins Length: 1.14 km No. of Junctions: 2 No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 2  Bus priority provided by bus gate.	Journey Time Inbound: 4.0 mins Journey Time Outbound: 3.7 mins Length: 1.14 km No. of Junctions: 2 No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 2  Full physical bus priority in both directions.
	<b>Rank</b>				
<b>2 Integration</b>	<b>2A Land Use Policy</b>	Integrates with existing residential, educational & leisure uses in this established area.	Integrates with existing residential, educational & leisure uses in this established area.	Integrates with existing residential, educational & leisure uses in this established area.	Integrates with existing residential, educational & leisure uses in this established area.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>2B Residential Population and Employment Catchments</b>	Similar Catchment for all route options.	Similar Catchment for all route options.	Similar Catchment for all route options.	Similar Catchment for all route options.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>2C Transport Network Integration</b>	Similar potential along all route options.	Similar potential along all route options.	Similar potential along all route options.	Similar potential along all route options.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>2D Cycle Network integration</b>	Cycle facilities delivered along Primary route and CBC.	Cycle facilities delivered along Primary route and CBC.	Cycle facilities delivered along Primary route and CBC.	Cycle facilities delivered along Primary route and CBC.

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option MR1 (EPR Option)	Option MR2 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)	Option MR3 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option MR4 (3-lanes with One-Way E-bound)
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>2E Traffic Network Integration</b>	No restrictions to general traffic.	No diversions for general traffic. Potential delays due to signal-controlled bus priority and reduced queuing capacity.	Inbound and Outbound through traffic and access to Ailesbury Road, Shrewsbury Road, Merlyn Road, Shrewsbury Park and majority of residential properties on Merrion Road requires diversion.  Restricts access to SVUH for outbound traffic.  For local access within the one-way section vehicles would need to approach from via Ailesbury Road or Shrewsbury Road as appropriate depending on destination.	Inbound through traffic and access to Ailesbury Road, Shrewsbury Road, Merlyn Road, Shrewsbury Park and majority of residential properties on Merrion Road requires diversion.  For local access within the one-way section vehicles from the east would need to approach from via Simmonscourt Road/Sandymount Avenue, or via Ailesbury Road and/or Shrewsbury Road.
	<b>Rank</b>				
<b>3 Accessibility &amp; Social Inclusion</b>	<b>3A Key Trip Attractors</b>	All routes service the same trip attractors.	All routes service the same trip attractors.	All routes service the same trip attractors.	All routes service the same trip attractors.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>3B Deprived Geographic Areas</b>	All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.
	<b>Rank</b>				

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option MR1 (EPR Option)	Option MR2 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)	Option MR3 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option MR4 (3-lanes with One-Way E-bound)
4 Safety	4A Road Safety	No. of junctions: 2 No turn movements required.	No. of junctions: 2 No turn movements required.	No. of junctions: 2 No turn movements required.	No. of junctions: 2 No turn movements required.
	Rank				
	4B Pedestrian Safety	Footpaths provided throughout. Signalised crossings at all major junctions.	Footpaths provided throughout. Signalised crossings at all major junctions.	Footpaths provided throughout. Signalised crossings at all major junctions.	Footpaths provided throughout. Signalised crossings at all major junctions.
	Rank				
5 Environment	5A Archaeology & Cultural Heritage	No recorded monuments within the study area.	No recorded monuments within the study area.	No recorded monuments within the study area.	No recorded monuments within the study area.
	Rank				
	5B Architectural Heritage	No properties within this section are on the Record of Protected Structures.  No appreciable impact	No properties within this section are on the Record of Protected Structures.  No appreciable impact	No properties within this section are on the Record of Protected Structures.  No appreciable impact	No properties within this section are on the Record of Protected Structures.  No appreciable impact
	Rank				
	5C Flora & Fauna	Requires the removal of 52 trees in public areas and 15 trees in private areas.  Total trees impacted: 67	Requires the removal of 37 trees in public areas and 0 trees in private areas.  Total trees impacted: 37	Requires the removal of 0 trees in public areas and 0 trees in private areas.  Total trees impacted: 0	Requires the removal of 21 trees in public areas and 0 trees in private areas.  Total trees impacted: 21
Rank					

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option MR1 (EPR Option)	Option MR2 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)	Option MR3 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option MR4 (3-lanes with One-Way E-bound)
	<b>5D Soils, Geology &amp; Hydrology</b>	No appreciable impact	No appreciable impact	No appreciable impact	No appreciable impact
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>5E Landscape &amp; Visual</b>	The widening works would require the removal of the majority of the existing trees within the footpath on both sides of Merrion Road in this section. This scheme option would require land-take and removal of some trees outside the current road boundary.	The widening works would require the removal of approximately half of the existing trees within the footpath on both sides of Merrion Road in this section, with the main impact being between Ailesbury Road and Shrewsbury Road.	This option would retain all existing trees along the section as the works are contained within the existing road extents.	The widening works would require the removal of approximately one third of the existing trees within the footpath on both sides of Merrion Road in this section, with the main impact being between Ailesbury Road and Shrewsbury Road.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>5F Air Quality</b>	Potential impact on air quality due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Merrion Road and retention of both general traffic lanes.	Potential impact on air quality due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the majority of this section of Merrion Road and the retention of both general traffic lanes.	Potential positive impact on air quality due to only two lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.	Potential positive impact on air quality due to only three lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.
	<b>Rank</b>				

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option MR1 (EPR Option)	Option MR2 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)	Option MR3 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option MR4 (3-lanes with One-Way E-bound)
	<b>5G Noise &amp; Vibration</b>	<p>Potential impact on noise and vibration due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Merrion Road and retention of both general traffic lanes.</p> <p>Proximity of road edge to residential properties is increased on both sides of the road over the majority of the section.</p>	<p>Potential impact on noise and vibration due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the majority of this section of Merrion Road and the retention of both general traffic lanes.</p> <p>Proximity of road edge to residential properties is decreased on both sides of the road over the majority of the section, however to a lesser extent than MR3.</p>	<p>Potential positive impact on noise and vibration due to only two lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.</p> <p>Proximity of road edge to residential properties is decreased significantly on both sides of the road over the majority of the section.</p>	<p>Potential positive impact on noise and vibration due to only three lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.</p> <p>Proximity of road edge to residential properties is decreased on both sides of the road over the majority of the section, however to a lesser extent than MR3.</p>
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>5H Land Use Character</b>	<p>The widening works would require the removal of the majority of the existing trees within the footpath on both sides of Merrion Road in this section. The land-take on the northern side would impact upon existing frontages and a number of trees in private gardens.</p>	<p>The widening works would require the removal of approximately half of the existing trees within the footpath on both sides of Merrion Road in this section, with the main impact being between Ailesbury Road and Shrewsbury Road.</p> <p>This option would result in a small amount of land-take to properties at Merrion Centre and the frontage of the Clayton Hotel</p>	<p>This option would retain all existing trees along the section as the works are contained within the existing road extents and there is not impact to properties.</p>	<p>The widening works would require the removal of approximately one third of the existing trees within the footpath on both sides of Merrion Road in this section, with the main impact being between Ailesbury Road and Shrewsbury Road. There is not impact to properties.</p>
	<b>Rank</b>				